



Further comment for the Scottish Select Committee and the Crown Estate 23 November 2011

1. It is clearly Marine Scotland and not Crown Estate that has let down communities in the monitoring of inshore waters. Whilst CE is the legal manager of the leases of the seabed, it is Marine Scotland whose duty it is to care for the marine environment. Marine Scotland has shown poor stewardship
2. Islands have distinct management issues compared to the mainland, including communication issues (distance and cost), a sense of isolation from centres of power and influence.
3. The importance of the statics as a group of inshore fishermen is neglected, and needs a much higher profile at the centres of power. The mobile sector is overrepresented at those seats of power and has undue influence on the policy on all marine matters in Scotland, whether it is quotas, protected areas and research.
4. Privatisation of the fisheries is going on and must be reversed. Similarly privatisation of the seabed must be averted. The territorial marine waters and seabed are held in trust for all the society not just the few.
5. It is clear from that Scottish Select Committee meeting listening to participants that the wider agenda of more devolution and towards independence is being pursued. The Crown Estate issues are a stalking horse...or sop...to give some, but not all, more power.
6. The participants appeared to be after the "pot of gold". COAST was the only one not making a direct bid for some of the money. I think they are all set up for disappointment. There is not a clear way forward for distributing CE funds, so there is a sense of setting up groups for disappointment. This of course could be a strategy for creating more discontent with Westminster. The marine communities wanting the funds for themselves forget those, whether a mile from the sea or far from the sea, which are also indirectly affected or impacted by marine developmentheavy lorries on roads etc.
7. There was a lack of recognition that Crown Estate is good on process, and experienced in marine management. It felt at times just an opportunity to throw bricks at the Crown Estate in Scotland, and by implication Westminster.
8. IFCAs in England and Wales are much better than IFGs in Scotland as there is a wider participation including communities and consultations.
9. Clarification of the dialogue between Phil Thomas and myself re. EIAs and the disease at St Molios fish farm:
 - Environmental Impact Assessments (EIAs) are required in the planning process now, a responsibility which is vested in local authority. There are many salmon farms, which were set up before more recent

planning finfish farm EIA requirements and St Molios is one of those. At the renewal of the lease, overdue at St Molios by 2 years, in theory an EIA will be required. It is one of the complaints of communities that small biomass fish farms are requesting to increase biomass on the same sites and there is no requirement for an EIA for this enlargement.

- Since the Scottish Select Affairs meeting I have spoken to the Marine Science Fish Health Inspectorate in Aberdeen. It was confirmed that St Molios had a severe outbreak of Amoebic Gill Disease (AGD). It is a disease, caused by an imbalance of host, pathogen (in this case several species of Amoeba) and environment. There is the concentration effect of biomass and the ease of cross infection, another factor that was not discussed in the exchange. It is a “naturally occurring event” in as much as tuberculosis in humans is a naturally occurring event when pathogen (in that case a bacterium), host, in this case human beings, often in large numbers, and environment (insanitary conditions, close proximity of people and people already susceptible due to overcrowding, poor diets etc). The claim about it being a naturally occurring event is a good example of obfuscation by the industry. The fact is that over concentration of animal populations magnifies the infection risk often beyond the ability of humans to control.

Thank you for the opportunity to be involved, to be listened to. As a small community lead organisation that was important.

Dr Sally Campbell
24 November 2011

THE COMMUNITY OF ARRAN SEABED TRUST LTD is a Company Limited by Guarantee
Registered Company No SC299917 at Companies House Edinburgh.
A Charity Registered in Scotland SC042088
The Old Hay Barn, Park terrace, Lamlash, Isle of Arran, KA27 8NB
COAST is the trading name of the above named Company
www.arrancoast.com



THE UNDERWOOD TRUST

COAST winner of the 2008 Observer Ethical Conservation Project of the Year